

MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

May 1, 2012

MAG Offices, Saguaro Room
302 N. 1st Avenue, Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Mayor Thomas L. Schoaf, Litchfield Park,
Chair

*Mayor Hugh Hallman, Tempe, Vice Chair

Steven Betts, GPEC

Dr. Joseph Cavinato, Thunderbird

Mark Dreher, East Valley Partnership

Thomas Franz, Greater Phoenix Leadership

Jim Kenny, El Dorado Holdings, Inc.

Mayor W.J. "Jim" Lane, Scottsdale

Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown

Mayor John Lewis, Gilbert

Mayor Marie Lopez-Rogers, Avondale

Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye

#Mary Peters, Mary Peters Consulting

*Jim Rounds, Elliott D. Pollack & Company

Floyd Roehrich, Jr., ADOT

Todd Sanders, Greater Phoenix Chamber
of Commerce

Mayor Jay Schlum, Fountain Hills

Mayor Elaine Scruggs, Glendale

Councilmember, Jack Sellers, Chandler

*Jeffrey Simmons, Ryley Carlock &
Applewhite

Mayor Scott Smith, Mesa

Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix

Sandra Watson, Arizona Commerce
Authority

*Candace Wiest, WESTMARC

*Supervisor Mary Rose Wilcox, Maricopa
County

Mayor Sharon Wolcott, Surprise

* Not present

Participated by video or telephone conference call

OTHERS PRESENT (from sign-in sheet(s)):

Eric Anderson, MAG

Roc Arnett, EVP

Anubhav Bagley, MAG

Len Becker, Town of Buckeye

Cheryl Covert, Town of Buckeye

Brent Cain, HDR Engineering

Michael Celaya, Surprise

Dan Davis, Avondale

Kent Dibble, Dibble Engineering

Jami Garrison, MAG

Jenna Goad, Glendale

Shirley Gunther, Avondale

Denise McClafferty, MAG

Christine McMurdy, Goodyear

Scott Powell, Gilbert

Linda Priano, MAG

Luis Ramirez, Ramirez Advisors

Amy St. Peter, MAG

Dennis Smith, MAG

Tim Strow, MAG

Kelly Taft, MAG

1. Call to Order

The Economic Development Committee (EDC) meeting was called to order by Chair Schoaf at 11:30 a.m. Chair Schoaf noted that Mary Peters was participating by telephone conference.

Chair Schoaf noted public comment cards were available for those members of the public who wish to comment. Transit tickets were available from Valley Metro for those using transit to come to the meeting. Parking validation was available for the MAG parking facilities for those who parked in the garage.

2. Call to the Audience

Chair Schoaf stated according to the MAG public comment process, members of the audience who wish to speak are requested to fill out the public comment cards. He stated that there is a three minute time limit. Public comment is provided at the beginning of the meeting for items that are not on the agenda that are within the jurisdiction of MAG, or non action agenda items that are on the agenda for discussion or information only. Chair Schoaf noted that no public comment cards had been received.

3. Approval of the April 3, 2012 Economic Development Committee Meeting Minutes

Chair Schoaf asked if the members had any questions regarding the April 3, 2012 meeting minutes. There were none.

Steve Betts moved to approve the April 3, 2012 Economic Development Committee meeting minutes. Dr. Cavinato seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

4. Report on the City of Phoenix “Buy Local” Policy

Mayor Stanton stated he mentioned at the last EDC meeting that the City of Phoenix had adopted a policy for procurement to support local businesses. He noted the Buy Local policy defines local business as locally owned businesses in this region for small contracts that are \$50,000 or less. Mayor Stanton introduced James Scarboro, Deputy Finance Director of Phoenix and Kimber Lanning, Director of Local First Arizona.

James Scarboro gave an overview of the Buy Local policy. He stated this policy came about by the Mayor and City Council wanting to increase opportunities for local businesses being able to participate in City procurements. He added this policy will help create jobs, reduce unemployment, increase state and local sales and income tax revenue, and will also encourage economic development.

Mr. Scarboro informed the committee of the new online vendor registration process where businesses can register online, maintain and update their own information, and identify what products and services they sell. He added that the City of Phoenix will actively encourage businesses to register, with the help of local business partners.

Mr. Scarboro stated the City of Phoenix will provide notices for all solicitations issued through the new system and the City will identify registered businesses and actively notify them via e-mail for solicitations that fit their business. He added local small businesses will self-certify when registering and this will expand the Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program. He stated these small businesses will be based on the Small Business Association (SBA) standards and local business means the principal place of business in Maricopa County.

Mr. Scarboro explained that when the City of Phoenix orders goods or services that cost less than \$50,000, the city will offer the job to a Maricopa County or Arizona-based company before it will send the work to a company out of state. He informed the committee that the Vendor Management System went live on April 10, 2012 and will accept registrations through June 30, 2012. He added new bid notices sent through the system to vendors will begin on July 1, 2012.

Mayor Stanton asked Mr. Scarboro to explain why this policy is for contracts \$50,000 or under. Mr. Scarboro explained anything over \$50,000 is considered a formal procurement and entails a different process, while \$50,000 and under is considered an informal procurement, which allows the City to invite companies to submit offers.

Dr. Cavinato asked what types of businesses have signed on so far. Mr. Scarboro stated there is a wide variety of small businesses and suppliers that have already registered. He noted that an internal procurement review and survey was conducted in December and the city asked for feedback from small, local companies. He added that there have been four procurement forums and over one hundred representatives from the business community have attended these round table forums.

Mr. Scarboro reported that Phoenix is one of the first municipalities in Arizona to adopt a local-first procurement policy to keep tax revenues from leaking to other states. It is estimated that \$17 million worth of city contracts a year would be available to the local community to bid on under the new policy. He invited other communities to adopt a similar policy and stated he could be reached at (602) 534-4460 or by e-mail at james.scarboro@phoenix.gov to answer any questions about the data collecting system and/or implementing a similar program.

Kimber Lanning, Director of Local First Arizona, stated that our region needs to find great solutions for doing more business in our local economy and she believes procurement is a economic development tool to grow jobs and keep money here. She noted San Diego, California had implemented a similar plan as the one Mr. Scarboro described, and in two

years, they did an additional \$40 million worth of business.

Ms. Lanning thanked Mayor Stanton and Mr. Scarboro for their leadership roles in implementing this policy and she wanted to stress that local means regional. She added since partnering with the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce and the Arizona Chamber of Commerce, Phoenix now has the resources to connect with the local business community and invited other communities to start to think regionally and to implement a similar policy. She noted Pima County and the City of Tucson are planning to develop a two-tiered process where they will look at Tucson and Pima County first and then statewide, before they look elsewhere. She also stated the City of Yuma is looking into a similar program. Ms. Lanning provided her phone number (602) 956-0909 and e-mail address kimber@localfirstaz.com if anyone would like additional information.

Chair Schoaf asked if there were any questions or comments.

Steve Betts asked in regards to contracts \$50,000 and under, is this exclusively available to local only businesses, and for over \$50,000 would the city take local businesses into consideration first. Mr. Scarboro stated that anything under \$50,000, local businesses will get preferential consideration, however, if there is no local business, they would widen their search. He added for contracts over \$50,000, a full, open competition would be in place.

Mayor Stanton clarified the reason the policy is \$50,000 or under is because legal authority does not allow the City of Phoenix to go above the \$50,000 amount.

Mr. Betts asked Ms. Lanning if she could go into more detail regarding urban fabric and adaptive reuse and how that effects economic development. Ms. Lanning reported a study recently came out that showed for the first time in 35 years, home sales in urban owned home units outpaced suburban home sales. She added our region will need to offer the type of lifestyle the next generation is looking for when living in a city center. Ms. Lanning stated some of these include mass transportation and access to international cuisine. She added one of the main initiatives of Local First Arizona is to find ways to get young entrepreneurs and businesses to conduct business in older buildings.

Councilman Sellers stated he discovered many purchasing departments rely on existing contracts which are excluding local suppliers, such as janitorial and office supplies. He added since meeting with Ms. Lanning, the City of Chandler now includes local businesses in the bidding opportunity process. Ms. Lanning added the growing database will help staff be able to connect to more local businesses.

Mayor Stanton issued a polite request to other communities to adopt a similar policy and invited their staff to meet with Mr. Scarboro to learn more details and see how easy it is to adopt the policy, so all of our local businesses can benefit.

Chair Schoaf stressed the importance to buy locally to help our towns, cities, and residents.

Chair Schoaf took a moment to announce this would be Mayor Schlum's last EDC meeting and wanted to recognize him for his commitment and service to this committee. Mayor Schlum thanked the committee and stated that great things are happening in our region and he appreciated the honor of working on this committee.

5. Discussion Regarding the Effectiveness of the Economic Development Committee

Chair Schoaf stated the EDC has a two year sunset clause, which comes in October 2012. He stated it is important to look at this committee's effectiveness and whether it should continue. He added this committee should examine what the EDC has done, has the effort been worthwhile, and to look back to see what has come out of the EDC. Chair Schoaf noted a draft charter was provided to all of the EDC members. He requested input on the scope of activities of the committee, the mission, membership, and terms, as we move forward. Chair Schoaf stated a survey was conducted to see the committee's effectiveness over the past eighteen months and asked Denise McClafferty to go over the survey findings.

Denise McClafferty informed the committee that the survey consisted of agenda items that took place in the past eighteen months and the highest scoring agenda item on the survey was the Greater Phoenix Rising website. She added some of the other high scoring items included the job recovery report, which was presented by Jim Rounds, the freight transportation framework study; the incubator presentations; the Thunderbird presentations and the aerospace and defense presentation. She noted a total of fourteen responses were received, with twelve responses stating the committee should continue and two saying it should not continue. Ms. McClafferty stated one of the comments she received on the survey was that a member was confused by the focus and the mission of the EDC. She suggested that this be addressed.

Chair Schoaf stated EDC was trying to accomplish three different goals. These goals include building institutional knowledge in the area of economic development so that MAG could fulfill its responsibility on transportation planning to take economic development into account. The second goal is to look for opportunities where MAG could partner with other entities in the region to take on projects that would further economic development. Chair Schoaf provided one example of this is partnering with Greater Phoenix Economic Council (GPEC) on the Greater Phoenix Rising website. He added the third goal is to have various stakeholders in the region have conversations on economic development as a general topic and find ways to work together to avoid duplication.

Chair Schoaf asked if there were any comments or questions.

Mayor Lane suggested that we continue to emphasize how the improvements in transportation will impact our economic development as a state. He did not think the current wording was clear under the committee's goals and mission.

Dennis Smith provided an example of when MAG was trying to do a Maricopa County only traffic model and heard comments from Mesa that the green coded intersections were constantly congested. He stated when MAG expanded the traffic model to Pinal County, the intersections turned red due to a commute pattern coming out of Northern Pinal County. He added transportation is a system and the system is only going to operate if we can reach out beyond borders and in this case we are reaching all the way to Nogales on the trade corridor. He added the mission of MAG should allow the committee to reach beyond MAG and this is why the Joint Planning Advisory Council (JPAC) was formed. He added because the three counties represent 85 percent of the population in the entire state, these counties need to be working together on their work programs in order to be effective. He suggested the committee modify the language in the charter to incorporate this.

Chair Schoaf added the focus is on Maricopa County. However, that does not mean we do not look at issues that are impacting business in our region. He hopes the committee can spend time on the wording so we do not lose sight of local jurisdictions shared problems, which includes economic development. Chair Schoaf also stated that one of the more important undertakings of the EDC was to lead the effort to look at border crossing needs and to bring together governmental planning units across the state to support changes in that area. He added it has a tremendous impact on the business that is done across our entire state, as well as this region.

Floyd Roehrich stated he felt there is a direct correlation between Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) and MAG and there are going to be opportunities conduit between the EDC and the state initiatives that are going on. He stated it is important to make sure that our efforts are coordinated for the greater good of the whole state and this region.

Mayor Lewis commented that as he filled out the survey he reflected on the positive impact that these agenda items had. He added he thought the Thunderbird group was fabulous and the impact of having the opportunity to work with GPEC and other agencies was very positive. He suggested that perhaps instead of a monthly meeting, the committee could consider meeting bimonthly. Mayor Lewis stated he felt it was important to mention to the committee business leaders that at the last Regional Council meeting some mayors expressed concerns of the EDC and policy making. He suggested that to elevate frustration, perhaps we should change the policy making wording in the charter.

Chair Schoaf commented that this was a very good point and policy making is a word the committee should consider removing out of the charter.

Thomas Franz stated he found the data sharing and presentations very informative and valuable. He feels what creates confusion is whether this committee is focused on transportation with the impact on economic development or on economic development and how transportation feeds into it. He added this committee needs a clear understanding on

who is leading what in the business community. Mr. Franz noted he believes we will have to deal with issues outside our region and does not see that as an issue.

Mayor Stanton agreed with Mr. Franz that in order for this committee to maximize its effectiveness we need to define what the EDC is and what it is not because there is confusion in the marketplace. He added some are not clear on what GPEC, Arizona Commerce Authority (ACA) and MAG do in regards to economic development and we need to clear up this confusion and define this committee.

Chair Schoaf stated although he is not confused by the three agencies, he could understand how some could be. He added the difference between this committee from the others is a different focus. The EDC committee has a much broader opportunity and is looking to find strategies to make the whole region a better place to do business, not to attract any specific individual business. He added GPEC and ACA deal with an individual economic opportunity, as it applies to the region or specific subset of the region, directed at a specific opportunity.

Mayor Stanton added this committee should also focus on the value of best practices and he would like to learn from this organization and other communities on what successful programs cities have to potentially adopt the programs. He noted we should also have open and honest dialogue on what cities should and should not be doing based on best practices and feels this would be a great forum for these types of discussions..

Mayor Smith stated that business leaders should know the difference between GPEC, ACA, and MAG. Mayor Smith agreed with Mayor Stanton that discussions at the EDC meetings would not have taken place anywhere else. He gave the example of the Nogales border discussions and said that this discussion would not have happened anywhere else. He added the beauty of EDC is in the last year and a half, this committee has provided a forum to have certain types of information and discussions to a group of people that does not gather any place else. He believes the success of the committee is shown by the amount of people who are still attending the meetings. He added, in his experience, if people do not see value, they quit coming. This has not happened at these meetings and believes this committee is filling a need.

Mayor Smith stated there is no doubt that whatever happens in this state does effect our region and gave the example of the border crossings in San Luis and Nogales and the huge impact the Sun Corridor has on this region. He noted the purpose of this committee is not to recruit or attract a specific business and the EDC is not in competition with ACA and GPEC. Mayor Smith added that Brookings contacted him and asked where they could go to develop a plan where everyone is at the table, which is why it landed in the EDC. He added the EDC provides assistance to add resources to other organizations to share the vision and plan on what this area can become.

Mayor Scruggs agreed that the discussions that take place here are of real value. She

suggested that perhaps the meetings could allow for broader discussion and not about policy making. She added we cannot criticize the business community for their confusion and it is something that we need to address. She noted ideas come from this committee and then members can take those ideas to their respective cities and organizations. She gave the example of the innovation incubator presentation and how excited she was to take it back to Glendale and the council members. She also commented that she took notes during today's presentation and will take it back to her staff to inform businesses in her community about the Local First database program. She believes this committee is the appropriate place to generate and incubate ideas and share information, but it is not the proper organization to implement the ideas. She noted this is the right place for these discussions because of all the leadership at the table.

Thomas Franz commented he wanted to clarify that business leaders just need to understand where to do what. He noted the EDC is the place for discussions of best known practices and methods, but to him, the way the charter is currently defined sounds broad and with the committee having eighteen months under their belt he believes the charter can now be resolved, better defined, and clarified.

Mayor Wolcott stated she was one of the first members to be appointed to this committee and had to temporarily leave and later returned because she finds value in this committee. She added she is concerned for members of MAG who are not at the table and are not able to participate in this forum. Mayor Wolcott commented that this would be valuable to every city, community, and the business community. She added that it is very difficult for her to represent everyone in the West Valley and noted everyone has a slightly different take. She stated it is important to continue these forums and to continue to talk a good deal about the focus of transportation, because this region has limited resources and needs to discuss how to strategically apply those resources. She added the EDC is a great place to have high level discussions, to share our successes, and to learn how we can help one another.

Mark Dreher stated as a member of the business community, his perspective is that this committee has done a great job in keeping up with current issues along with things that have been discussed in the past, such as deep water port discussions. He noted with the leadership around this table, efforts can be coordinated and the big opportunities are within reach. He added being part of the business community, he hears comments from business owners and he can now say there is an organization where there is communication and partnerships between the cities and towns, state, and the business community. He added every business is looking for information on where to put their strategy, and thinks this organization provides more ideas.

Mayor Scruggs added the importance of transportation will always be key in this valley to the growth plans that the private sector wants. She agreed with Mayor Wolcott that what is generated among this committee should definitely go to the entire elected leadership of this region and business members through MAG Transportation Policy Committee (TPC) and MAG Regional Council.

Mayor Smith stated he hopes this committee can sit down with Greater Phoenix Leadership, ACA, GPEC and other entities, to ask them how the EDC can work best with them. He added EDC is a unique committee that the other organizations should take advantage of when talking about economic development and a desire to discuss, but not make, policy issues. Mayor Smith stated there is no other place where you have 10-15 mayors or council members, and business leadership, in the same room to discuss economic development.

Mayor Meck stated he agrees with Mayor Smith that the conversations that he hears at these meetings are very valuable. He stated after hearing the incubator presentation, he contacted the presenters and had them speak at the Town of Buckeye and developed a work study. He added when APL presented at the EDC, Buckeye contacted them to present at a meeting. Mayor Meck commented that he was not aware of the Thunderbird Consulting Practicum until their presentation at EDC, and after the meeting, he contacted them. In addition, after the Brookings presentation at the EDC meeting, he had the Urban Land Institute come to the Town of Buckeye. He stated the discussions at this forum helps the Town of Buckeye and no other committee comes close to these meetings. He added the group that sits at this table benefits the Town of Buckeye and believes this committee will certainly help the region.

Sandra Watson stated this conversation is very healthy and beneficial. She expressed that she is honored to be part of this group. She added having the direct leadership of every community engaged in the conversation on whether or not transportation is the driver of this committee is a great conversation to have. She believes there are strategies where transportation will be the driver, but there will also be other strategies where it will help support opportunities, without being the main focus. Ms. Watson stated that from the state's perspective, the dialogue from this committee is very informative and helpful to ACA as they design implementation and execution strategies. She added the forum itself is the value, along with the members around the table. She stated the partnering and supporting organizations will figure out how we all fit and who leads what effort, depending on the strategy. Ms. Watson stated ACA really wants to be helpful and supportive in advancing strategies at the state level.

Mayor Lane agreed this conversation is very valuable. He suggested that the mission needs to be clarified, and that policy should not be made at this committee. He noted that transportation needs to be the focus. He added he has been positively impacted by this meeting and thanked everyone for their comments.

Dennis Smith stated he has heard various comments outside of these meetings and one thing he thinks can be improved upon is to get the views and perspectives of the economic development staff that work for the cities and counties.

Chair Schoaf thanked everyone for their input and noted MAG staff will be working on the charter to incorporate what was discussed here today.

6. Metropolitan Business Planning Initiative Update

This item was not heard due to length of meeting. This agenda item will be on a future agenda.

7. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Schoaf asked if there were any requests for future agenda items. There were none.

8. Comments from the Committee

Mayor Meck announced that all of the committee members are invited to the Palo Verde Nuclear Emergency Safety Center on Airport Road on June 14, 2012 from 7:30 a.m. to 11:00 a.m. for an Economic Forum. This forum will include the Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station impact study that indicates the station generated \$1.8 billion.

Chair Schoaf stated the next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, June 5, 2012.

Adjournment

Mayor Schlum moved to adjourn the meeting. Mayor Meck seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously. There being no further business, the Economic Development Committee meeting was adjourned at 1:16 p.m.

Chair

Secretary